



COMPLIANCE BULLETIN

ERISA fiduciary litigation trend: Health plans and voluntary benefits

Taken together, these developments reflect a noteworthy shift in how Employee Retirement Income Security Act (ERISA) fiduciary standards are being applied. The Northwestern ruling raises questions for employers offering multiple health plan tiers, while the voluntary benefits cases seek to extend ERISA fiduciary obligations to a category of benefits that has generally been regarded as exempt from such requirements. If the plaintiffs in these cases prevail, it could have significant implications for how employers select carriers, oversee brokers, and evaluate compensation arrangements. Although both matters remain at early procedural stages, employers should remain mindful of how fiduciary principles may apply across all employee benefit offerings.

EMPLOYER ACTION ITEMS

In light of these developments, employers should take the following steps to evaluate how they currently manage and administer their benefit offerings:

- Audit all health plan tiers to ensure higher-premium options provide commensurate benefits relative to lower-cost alternatives.
- Review plan communications for accuracy & completeness regarding cost & value differences between plan options.
- Document the process & rationale used to select carriers & structure benefit offerings.
- Review broker & consultant compensation for voluntary benefit programs & assess whether fees are reasonable.
- Reassess reliance on the voluntary benefits safe harbor exemption under ERISA.
- Consult benefits counsel to evaluate potential exposure as litigation progresses.

Brought to you by:
PM Group Benefit Advisors II, LLC

ERISA fiduciary litigation trend: Health plans and voluntary benefits

Fiduciary obligations under ERISA have long been associated with retirement plan management, but that's changing. A growing wave of litigation has begun testing whether those same standards apply to group health plans and voluntary benefits such as accident, critical illness, and hospital indemnity insurance. While early cases, including a class action against Johnson & Johnson alleging mismanagement of prescription drug benefits through its pharmacy benefit manager arrangements, were dismissed on procedural grounds, subsequent legal developments suggest that courts are increasingly willing to let these claims move forward.

Health plan litigation

In *Barbich v. Northwestern University*, current and former employees filed a class action alleging the university breached its ERISA fiduciary duties by failing to prudently select and monitor the plan's preferred provider organization (PPO) insurance options and failing to disclose material information to plan participants. At issue in the case is the plan's "Premier PPO" option, which had a higher premium and didn't provide commensurate benefits as compared to the "Value PPO" option. A federal judge denied the motion to dismiss, marking a departure from prior similar cases that have struggled to get past the pleadings stage.

Voluntary benefits cases

Four coordinated class actions were filed against major employers over the management and administration of their accident, critical illness, and hospital indemnity insurance programs. Among the allegations are that the employers failed to prudently select and monitor carriers and broker compensation, causing plan participants to pay excessive and unreasonable premiums. The cases are at varying stages and litigation remains ongoing, but additional cases against other employers have followed, suggesting this is an area of litigation that's likely to continue to grow.



A growing wave of litigation has begun testing whether those same standards apply to group health plans and voluntary benefits such as accident, critical illness, and hospital indemnity insurance.



Please contact us with any questions.

Claudia Hermiz

248-375-7362 | claudia.hermiz@plantemoran.com

Ethan Kohagen

248-375-7124 | ethan.kohagen@plantemoran.com

Jackson Mahle

248-375-7201 | jackson.mahle@plantemoran.com

Scott McLellan

248-375-7281 | scott.mclellan@plantemoran.com

Rebecca Morman

248-375-7240 | rebecca.morman@plantemoran.com

Conlan Mueser

248-375-7132 | conlan.mueser@plantemoran.com

Kally Palmer

313-496-7228 | kally.palmer@plantemoran.com

Maria Pettelle

248-375-7180 | maria.pettelle@plantemoran.com

Meribeth Rains

248-375-7114 | meribeth.rains@plantemoran.com

Sam Sajdak

248-375-7482 | sam.sajdak@plantemoran.com

Emily Scharnowski

616-643-4119 | emily.scharnowski@plantemoran.com

Harrison Smith

248-375-7185 | harrison.smith@plantemoran.com

Kara Stineman

248-375-7349 | kara.stineman@plantemoran.com

Jonathon Trionfi

248-375-7475 | jonathon.trionfi@plantemoran.com

This Compliance Bulletin is not intended to be exhaustive nor should any discussion or opinions be construed as legal advice. Readers should contact legal counsel for legal advice.
©2024-2026 Zywave, Inc. All rights reserved.